

# TECHNICAL VOCATIONAL EDUCATION IN THE CONTEXT OF GLOBALIZATION: ITS PEDAGOGY AND STRATEGIES

---

## ABSTRACT

**Aims:** The aim of this study was to determine the personal experiences of the teacher-participants in the teaching of Technology and Livelihood Education. It also ascertained and met the following objectives: 1) determine the teaching experiences of the TLE teachers; 2) to identify the training needs of TLE teachers; 3) ascertain the challenges faced by the TLE teachers; 3) discover the pedagogy and strategies used by the TLE teachers; and 4) find out the recommendations of the TLE teachers to improve the delivery of the course.

**Study design:** Qualitative-phenomenological approach.

**Place and Duration of Study:** The study was conducted in Sta Cruz National High School, Sta. Cruz, Davao del Sur. The study was conducted for 6 months.

**Methodology:** The researchers purposely chose all the Technology and Livelihood Education (TLE) teachers. The information were gathered through Focus Group Discussion (FGD).

**Results:** Six themes emerged from the data analysis. Generally, the teacher-participants found teaching of TLE subject was challenging because the activities were focused on exploration. Moreover, they felt satisfied because they were able to share their knowledge and skills to their students. It implies that the TLE teachers were committed and dedicated to their jobs despite the difficulties they encountered. However, the teacher-participants revealed that generally, they were not sent outside of the school to attend training-seminar for skills enhancement. It is an indication that the school heads lack concern for their teachers' professional development. In addressing the challenges of the teachers, they collaborate with each other by sharing their resources. Despite the challenges they encountered, they were still optimistic to be globally competitive. It implies that the TLE teachers do not give up easily. They suggested that the school administration needed to develop the participants' personal character so that their teaching goals were met.

**Conclusion:** The TLE teachers loved and enjoyed their teaching jobs despite the challenges they faced. However, they clamored to the Department of Education (DepEd) to address their needs such as sending them to trainings and seminar-workshop to enhance their skills and capabilities. To show their dedication to their jobs, they brought their own tools and shared the same to other teachers. Notably, the participants only used three teaching strategies. It shows that TLE teachers lack the knowledge of other teaching strategies. The participants were optimistic that sooner or later their TLE programs are accredited and recognized locally and internationally. This implies that the participants were committed to their jobs. Ironically, they suggested that improvement of the teachers' self was better than improving the TLE implementation. This shows that the teachers believed that materials can be easily acquired but not the attitude.

*Keywords: Technical vocational education, globalization, pedagogy, strategies, Davao del Sur*

## 1. INTRODUCTION

17 Globalization exists and affects the life and work of the people and the societies<sup>20</sup>.  
18 Globalization is a force that changed the way how people and nations deal with one another  
19 <sup>9</sup> particularly in the area of international commerce <sup>58,42</sup>. Workers should be equipped with  
20 different skills which are in demand by the current industries <sup>45,53</sup>. These skills can be  
21 achieved through enrolling the technical and vocational education which follows the  
22 international standards of the industries. <sup>16</sup> said that skills can be best acquired through  
23 training; while <sup>15, 30</sup> point out that top skills need of contemporary industries are technical  
24 knowledge, problem solving, and collaboration, time management, conceptual competence,  
25 and abstract thinking. Thus, <sup>61</sup> aver that academic institutions need to prepare students for  
26 the industry jobs, and that curriculum development and implementation should not be the  
27 sole responsibility of the academe.

28  
29 This is now a challenge for Technical Vocational Education (TVE) or Technology and  
30 Livelihood Education (TLE) teachers to transfer knowledge and skills to the students aligned  
31 with the international standards and competencies of the different skills and specializations.  
32 Technology and Livelihood Education is composed of four (4) areas: Home Economics,  
33 Industrial Arts, Information and Computer Technology and Agro-Fishery Arts.  
34 This makes teaching TLE a challenging task. TLE teachers must be knowledgeable, skillful  
35 and competent in demonstrating skills in any of the four TLE areas. Additionally, several  
36 authors mentioned various hindrances in the delivery of TVE like qualitative technological  
37 human resources development to make create skilled, self-reliant technicians <sup>28, 43</sup>; limited  
38 incentives <sup>26</sup>; poverty <sup>31</sup>; lack of resources and low professional capacity <sup>3</sup> and shortage of  
39 adequate teaching materials <sup>10</sup>.

40 The challenges faced by TVE/TLE teachers in teaching 21<sup>st</sup> century learners in the field of  
41 technology and livelihood are tremendous. It is expected that the learners would develop  
42 their critical thinking, problem solving skills, and communication skills in the classroom  
43 activities. TLE/TVE teachers must be good facilitators of learning and develop knowledge  
44 and skills of the students through different laboratory activities which include students'  
45 performance tasks and project making. Teachers should have strategies which could help  
46 develop students' creativity, innovativeness and collaborative skills. The use of the  
47 community as a laboratory for learning also develops students' 21st century skills as well as  
48 the learners' awareness of their environment. However, TLE teachers have difficulties in  
49 applying different strategies and transferring of skills to the students<sup>65</sup>. Factors which affect  
50 this problem are the shortage of skills and lack of materials<sup>35</sup>. These problems are usually  
51 experienced in the implementation of a new curriculum.

52 The Department of Education encourages TVE/TLE teachers to undergo trainings and gain  
53 skills in the different specializations. However, teachers have to spend their own resources  
54 and voluntarily subject themselves to NC II Assessments and Trainers' Methodologies  
55 trainings in order for them to get the knowledge and skills needed. With the knowledge and  
56 skills gained from the trainings and assessments, the teachers come up with an effective  
57 pedagogy and strategies to transfer the knowledge and skills in order for their students to  
58 become globally competitive.

59  
60 Thus, this study was conducted to determine the experiences of the TLE teachers in  
61 teaching TLE subjects. Moreover, it also looked into the strategies used by TLE teachers in  
62 delivering their lessons in the context of globalization. Likewise, it identified the teachers'  
63 faced challenges and culled recommendations to improve their teaching. This study was  
64 relevant because only few studies dealt with the TLE because it was a new curriculum of the  
65 K-12 program. Thus, this study can contribute to the improvement and development of the  
66 TLE program.

## 67 68 **1.1 Research Questions**

69 The general aim of this study was to determine the personal experiences of the teacher-  
70 participants in the teaching of TLE. Particularly, it sought to meet the following objectives:

- 71 1. To determine the teaching experiences of the TLE teachers;
- 72 2. To identify the training needs of TLE teachers;
- 73 3. To ascertain the challenges faced by the TLE teachers;
- 74 4. To discover the pedagogy and strategies used by the TLE teachers; and
- 75 5. To find out the recommendations of the TLE teachers for improving the delivery of  
76 the course.

## 77 78 **1.2 Significance of the Study**

79 The following are the beneficiaries of the study:

80 School Administrators. The results of the study will guide school administrators on the  
81 conditions of the TLE teachers; thus, initiate programs to address the technical and  
82 professional needs of the teachers.

83  
84 TLE Teachers. The results of the study will help TLE teachers to determine what other  
85 pedagogy and strategies can be used in order to enhance the technical skills of the students.  
86 Moreover, the results may become their evidence to suggest for relevant innovations for  
87 TLE.

88 Students of TLE. The results of this study may give the student hints to the real situations of  
89 the TLE teachers; thus, suggest relevant ideas on what strategies best for them.

## 90 91 **1.3. Scope and Delimitation**

92 The focus of this study was on the experiences of the teachers handling different  
93 specializations in TVE/TLE such as Agro-fishery Arts, Industrial Arts, Information and  
94 Communication Technology and Home Economics. It did not include other subject teachers.  
95 Additionally, this study was conducted in different Junior and Senior High Schools in Davao  
96 del Sur. Moreover, the study used the qualitative method; hence, only limited number of  
97 participants was involved. According to <sup>51, 1</sup>, a study cannot make generalization of results if  
98 the number of participants is not statistically viable. Thus, the results may only be applied to  
99 the actual population included in the sampling frame. For <sup>12</sup>, because of number-limitation,  
100 the study can't offer recommendations, rather an implication.

## 101 102 **1.4 Definition of Terms**

103 The following terms used in this study were defined for better understanding of concepts.

104 Technical Vocational Education (TLE). This pertains to the program offered in Junior High  
105 Schools under the K-12 program. This program has four components, Agri-Fishery Arts,  
106 Home Economics, and Industrial.

107  
108 Technical Vocational Education Teachers. These are individuals who are assigned to teach  
109 the TLE courses in the Junior or Senior High Schools.

110  
111 Globalization. This refers to the intensification of cross-area and cross-border social relations  
112 <sup>52</sup>; an institutionalized cultural account which describe reality and makes sense about how  
113 the world works <sup>63</sup>; a process of greater integration within the world economy through  
114 movements of goods and services, capital, technology and labor, including education, which  
115 lead to increase economic decisions being influenced by global conditions <sup>27</sup>.

116  
117 Pedagogy. This pertains to a theory on a teaching/learning process that guides the teachers'  
118 choice of classroom practices by providing criteria to evaluate specific educational strategies  
119 and techniques in terms of the desired course outcomes <sup>54</sup>. It proposed that students expect  
120 to learn something generalizable contexts instead of just become informed of facts <sup>11</sup>.

121

122 Teaching Strategies. In general sense, these are approaches and techniques used by  
123 teachers to motivate and engage students<sup>34</sup>. In a deeper and specific sense,<sup>49</sup> cite that  
124 teaching strategies may differ depending on the teachers' pedagogical orientation. Thus, a  
125 teacher may base his / her strategies on formal, descriptive, and normative theories of  
126 teaching.

127

## 128 **2. MATERIAL AND METHODS / EXPERIMENTAL DETAILS / METHODOLOGY**

129

### 130 **2.1 Research Design**

131 This study used the qualitative-phenomenological approach. According to<sup>36</sup>, qualitative  
132 method is used when investigation needs to know the participants' opinions. Likewise, it is  
133 also used when a study tries to understand individuals' personal encounter of an experience  
134<sup>60</sup>. Moreover,<sup>50</sup> say that qualitative method is essentially relevant if the study aims to  
135 determine the importance of the individual's lived experiences. On the other hand,<sup>8</sup>  
136 mentions that qualitative method is best when a study needs personal narration and  
137 reflection of lived experience. On the other hand, phenomenological approach focuses on  
138 the experience-based design<sup>32</sup>. The use of focus group allows individual who have similar  
139 experiences to be together<sup>44</sup>; it is an effective mechanism to generate understanding and  
140 gain insight of the participants<sup>24</sup>. In this investigation, the individuals' lived experiences of  
141 the TLE teachers were in focus. They were formed into group and in turn shared their  
142 experiences.

143

### 144 **2.2 Locale of the Study**

145 The study was conducted in public secondary schools in Sta. Cruz, Davao del Sur.  
146 Particularly in Sta Cruz National High School. It is located specifically located at Camposo  
147 Road, Poblacion, Sta. Cruz. Moreover, it is a Department of Education manage partially  
148 urban secondary public school.

149

### 150 **2.3 Sampling Procedure**

151 This qualitative-phenomenological study used the non-probability sampling method in  
152 selecting the teacher-participants. The researchers purposely chose all the TLE teachers of  
153 Sta. Cruz National High School, Davao del Sur. They were selected because they were the  
154 individuals who had the knowledge about the topic under study.<sup>19</sup> avers that purposive  
155 sampling allows the selection of participants who are most suitable to pre-determined criteria  
156 set by the researchers. In same vain,<sup>18</sup> point out that purposive sampling is usually used by  
157 researcher if they have in mind and participants who suit the purpose of the study.

158

### 159 **2.4 Research Instrument**

160 The research instrument used in this study was a researchers-made interview guide  
161 questionnaire. The questions and probe-questions were based on the research questions.  
162 The interview-guide questions were validated by experts. This was done to assess and  
163 shape its contents<sup>21</sup>; determine its reliability<sup>48</sup>; ascertain its outcome efficiency<sup>66</sup>. The  
164 researchers were convinced that validating the interview guide-questions gave them the  
165 opportunity to polish thoroughly the questions for its purpose.

166

### 167 **2.5 Data Collection Procedures**

168 Observation of proper data collection procedures allows the attainment of reliability and  
169 transparency<sup>47</sup>. It also permits a systematic conduct of the study<sup>5</sup>. In this study, three steps  
170 were followed.

171

172 Preliminary Stage. During this stage, the researchers got the approval to conduct the study  
173 through a formal letter. After the permission was obtained, formal letters of invitations were  
174 also sent to the different TLE teachers. Moreover, it was during this stage when the research

175 questions, together with the interview guide questionnaire, were composed and subjected to  
176 validation.

177

178 Data Collection Preparation Stage. At this stage, a focus group discussion was conducted.  
179 During the interview, the researchers allowed all participants to talk and disallowing  
180 manipulation of answers. With permission from the participants, the interview proceedings  
181 were recorded. After the focus group interview, the researchers transcribe the proceedings.

182

183 Data Analysis Stage. At this phase, the thematic analysis of information was conducted. In  
184 the analysis, data analyst involved memoing, coding, and thematic analysis. Then, patterns  
185 of responses were formulated into themes.

186

## 187 **2.6 Trustworthiness of the Study**

188 In handling the issues of trustworthiness<sup>13</sup> of this research, the researchers observed four  
189 essential procedures in order for gathered information to be reliable. These included  
190 credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability.<sup>39</sup> explained that credibility is  
191 established when there is a prolonged engagement between the participants and the  
192 researchers. In this study, this was not an issue because all the participants and researcher  
193 were DepEd teachers and they have known each other for some time. Animosity among the  
194 participants was not an issue because they already built trust with each other. Thus, the  
195 researchers were confident because the atmosphere of easiness with the participants was  
196 established.

197

198 On the other hand,<sup>40</sup> said that transferability is obtained when the results of the study will be  
199 utilized by other researchers in their search for clarifications; and degree in which the  
200 research can be transferred to other contexts. This particular aspect was realized in this  
201 study because its result would give essential insights to the school heads, readers and  
202 researchers information on the reality of TLE programs. Moreover, transferability is  
203 addressed when the researchers make specific details of the situations and methods which  
204 readers can compare to similar situation that they have knowledge about.

205

206 The concept of dependability is based on the assumption of replicability or repeatability of  
207 the study<sup>14, 21</sup>. The researchers observed this aspect by strictly following the standard in the  
208 conduct of research. The researchers subjected the research questions to experts' validation  
209 for validity and reliability. Likewise, enough related studies were provided in all areas of this  
210 study to strengthen the results and claims. Lastly, confirmability refers to the authenticity of  
211 the results which could be verified by others<sup>58</sup>. This aspect was established in this research  
212 through the thematic analysis of information. The thematic analysis of data applied  
213 memoing, coding, and vertical and horizontal procedures. Further, recordings and transcripts  
214 of the gathered information were available upon the request of the readers.

215

## 216 **2.7 Data Analysis**

217 After the recorded interview was transcribed, the researchers gave the same to a data  
218 analyst. In the process of data analysis, the analyst applied memoing thru vertical analysis,  
219 coding thru horizontal analysis, and thematic analysis thru looking for patterns.<sup>6</sup> mention that  
220 memoing is used to assist in making the conceptual leaps from the raw data. Moreover,<sup>66</sup>  
221 points out that memoing is used to make reflections on the data under analysis. Likewise,  
222 coding is conducted to facilitate the process of reading to create a storyline; to categorize the  
223 information into codes; and to clarify and interpret the information<sup>55</sup>. Finally, thematic  
224 analysis is used to look for patterns in the responses of the participants<sup>7</sup> and identifying  
225 meaning<sup>27</sup>. The results of the analyses were put into table indicating the themes, frequency  
226 of responses, and core ideas.

227

228 **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

229 Shown below are the results of the focus group conducted among the TLE teachers of  
 230 various educational backgrounds. <sup>40</sup> argue that in presenting qualitative information, a table  
 231 may be provided although its use is still debated. However, <sup>12</sup> mentions that qualitative  
 232 research has the prerogative to decide on the format. Thus, in the presentation of the results  
 233 of this study, a table is used for better and easy understanding. Moreover, in classifying the  
 234 information obtained, the frequency is considered *General* if the responses have 50% of  
 235 more recurrence; *Typical* if there is 21-49% reactions specified in the interview; and *Variant*  
 236 if the reactions' occurrence is 20% less.

237 Table 1. Themes and Core Ideas on TLE Pedagogical Strategies  
 238

Themes	Frequency of Response	Core Ideas
Perceptions on teaching	General	- challenging because it focuses on exploration - enjoying to share knowledge to students
Professional growth attended	General Variant	- having no training attended - spending personal money - schooling through scholarship
Handling difficulties in teaching	Typical Variant	- collaborating with other TVE teachers - bringing own tools - using video clips - reading food magazines
Methodologies used in teaching	Variant	- cooperative learning - demonstrating to students - using independent learning
Aspiration for certification	General	- aiming to be globally competitive
Recommendations for improvement	General	- developing teachers' personal character

239  
 240 **3.1 Perceptions on teaching**

241 Generally, the teacher-participants considered the teaching of TLE to be challenging. It was  
 242 so because the activities were focused on exploration. Moreover, they also felt satisfied  
 243 because they were able to share their knowledge and skills to their students. This implies  
 244 that the TLE teachers were committed and dedicated to their jobs despite the difficulties they  
 245 encountered. Moreover, these teachers were most likely oriented to the tasks assigned to  
 246 them. <sup>4</sup> mention that TLE teachers understand their roles which are to improve teaching and  
 247 learning strategies, develop TLE students' competencies, and meet the industry  
 248 requirements. Thus, teachers should train students to be equipped with the essential skills  
 249 for their future jobs <sup>45, 53</sup> like technical knowledge, problem solving and collaboration, time  
 250 management, conceptual ability, and abstract thinking <sup>15, 30</sup>. It is inevitable for the academe  
 251 and the industries to have collaborative effort to develop industry-based curricula <sup>61</sup>.

252  
 253 **3.2 Professional growth attended**

254 It was a sad revelation that generally, the teacher-participants hadn't attended training-  
 255 seminar which could enhance their skills. It is an indication that the school heads lack  
 256 concern on his/her teachers' professional development. It was also revealed that the  
 257 teachers used their own money to finance their attendance to trainings. This implies that  
 258 their schools have no budget for their teachers' skills development. Hence, other teachers  
 259 looked for scholarships. <sup>45</sup> mentions that TLE training has always been the issue not only in  
 260 Indonesia but also in other ASEAN member countries. <sup>28, 43</sup> added that development of

261 human resource to develop them into skilled and self-reliant technicians was one of the  
262 many hindrances in the delivery of TVE.<sup>40, 2</sup> point out that teachers' re-training programs  
263 are essential to improve and develop not only their performance skills and knowledge but  
264 also their abilities to make teaching and learning effective.  
265

### 266 3.3 Handling difficulties in teaching

267 In addressing the challenges of the teachers, they collaborate with each other by sharing  
268 resources. Variantly, some teachers brought their tools to school because the school didn't  
269 have materials.<sup>3</sup> mention that lack of resources and shortage of adequate teaching  
270 materials for TVE are sad realities for teachers handling TVE courses. Innovatively,  
271 teachers used video clips so that students could better understand the concepts. Other  
272 teachers used food magazines because these reading materials had colorful illustrations.<sup>68</sup>  
273 that aside from other challenges encounter by the TLE teachers, they also face the limited  
274 numbers of teaching facilities; <sup>60</sup> also points out that generally, teachers in developing  
275 countries needs to deal with the lack of necessary laboratories where they can conduct their  
276 TLE classes. <sup>56</sup> also mentions that available TLE materials are outdated and lack  
277 maintenance. This implies that the TLE implementation is not thoroughly planned because of  
278 inadequacy of necessary materials for the realization of its goals. Thus, this problem hinders  
279 the students to acquire different skills required by the current industries<sup>45,53</sup>.  
280

### 281 3.4 Methodologies used in teaching

282 In explaining the concepts to the students, teacher used various methods. One of these was  
283 cooperative learning, demonstration, and independent learning. In cooperative learning,  
284 students were formed in a group so that they collectively work the task given. Usually in  
285 cooperative learning, the group chose its leader who steered the group. On the other hand,  
286 in demonstration, the teacher followed the modeling approach where he or she performed  
287 the task first for the students to follow. The focus of this approach was on the process on  
288 how something was to be done appropriately. Thus, students learn the skill. Lastly, teachers  
289 allowed the students to have independent learning which aimed at allowing the students to  
290 constructively discover knowledge and skills on their own.<sup>29</sup> mention that TLE teachers  
291 should emphasize the development of skills among students such as teamwork,  
292 communication, and problem solving. On the other hand, <sup>67</sup> assert that for the transfer of  
293 ability to be successful, teachers should use metacognitive teaching strategy which includes  
294 independent learning. By this, students learn to discover their technical skills.  
295

### 296 3.5 Aspiration for certification

297 Despite all the challenges the teachers were dealing with, the lack of technical trainings,  
298 seminars, and the lack of materials, they were optimistic to be globally competitive. This  
299 implies that the TLE teachers do not give up easily. These teachers clamor for certification  
300 because they want their TLE programs to be recognized, competitive, and attractive.  
301 Certification of program implies quality<sup>35</sup> and good management<sup>54</sup>. Thus, certification is  
302 an important means of legitimizing the TLE as a good course to take.  
303

### 304 3.6 Recommendations for improvement

305 Interestingly, all the teachers' recommendations did not focus on addressing their needs  
306 rather on developing their personal character so that their teaching goals were met.  
307 According to<sup>23</sup> personal indicators such as expectations about the job become the reasons  
308 some individuals strive to understand teachers' expectations. Moreover, <sup>36</sup> say that making  
309 learning personally meaningful comes from the constructivist perspective, which stresses  
310 cooperation to accommodate the many time-constraints imposed by personal responsibilities  
311 and commitments.  
312

## 313 5. CONCLUSION

314 Generally, TLE teachers are enjoying their jobs despite the difficulties they faced. However,  
315 this happiness is may be short-lived if the Department of Education will remain unmindful of  
316 the needs of TLE teachers. Moreover, the teacher-participants showed their dismay because  
317 they had not been attended trainings to enrich their skills and to learn new knowledge. Due  
318 to the lack of equipment and supplies, teachers bring their own tools and share the same  
319 with others. It implies that the TVE program is implemented despite the inadequacy of  
320 materials or budget. On the other hand, only three teaching strategies are used by the study-  
321 participants. This only shows that TLE teachers lack knowledge of the many teaching  
322 strategies. This can be addressed through trainings and workshops. However, despite their  
323 conditions, teacher-participants remain positive that sooner or later their TLE program will be  
324 accredited and recognized locally and internationally. Ironically the participants did not  
325 suggest improvement for the schools rather improvement for themselves. They fatally  
326 accepted their powerlessness. They know that the great and strong bureaucracy in the  
327 Department of Education (DepEd) hinder the delivery of the necessary materials and  
328 professional development. Ironically, the Department of Education boosts the conduct of  
329 annual re-tooling; however, those trainings are only intended for the selected few. Thus,  
330 many teachers clamor for more trainings. Likewise, the issue of teacher-student ratio  
331 remains unresolved but getting worst. How can a lone TVE teachers teach 50 or more  
332 students? Everything becomes superficial and hypocritical learning. Students come to class  
333 for compliance and not really to obtain skills. Recently, skills' evaluation results of the first  
334 batch of graduates of K-12 program show that students are not industry ready workforce.  
335 The Department of Education may consider conducting regular evaluation so that needs can  
336 be identified and given appropriate solutions.

337  
338

#### **4.1 Implication for practice**

339 The challenges in teaching TLE in public high schools are real. It can't be solved by the TLE  
340 themselves rather by a strong and concrete solution involving other stakeholders. Teachers  
341 are known to be resilient; however, everything has its limits. The results of this study  
342 implicate that the Department of Education (DepEd) needs to review its Recruitment and  
343 Selection Requirements (RSR). It should only consider and hire qualified teachers who are  
344 expert of their field. Moreover, the Department needs to re-visit its annual retooling program  
345 for teachers because its effectiveness is not felt. The Department may consider a clinical  
346 approach. Likewise, DepEd may allocate budget for acquisition of TLE equipment and  
347 subscription of readings materials and videos or school heads may ask the help of the  
348 Parents' Teachers Association (PTA) to help in provide the essential materials for the TLE.  
349 Further, school heads should not only aim for NC II certification but also international  
350 accreditation. The school heads may collaborate with international academic institutions for  
351 skills and knowledge enhancement. Lastly, curriculum evaluation and mapping may be  
352 conducted in partnership with the identified industry partners to determine the needs of the  
353 course.

354

#### **COMPETING INTERESTS**

355

356 The was no competing interest exist in the conduct of this study.

357

358

#### **ETHICAL APPROVAL**

359

360 To address the ethics in conducting a research study, the researchers considered some  
361 measures to handle the confidentiality of the participants and the information obtained.  
362 Firstly, consent letters were given to the participants to seek for their permissions. Secondly,  
363 the interview protocol which states that no revelation of true identity shall be done and  
364 participants may opt to use pseudonyms to hide their identities was strictly observed. Thirdly,  
365 the in-depth interview was conducted in a secluded office that provided ample privacy, little  
366 destructions, and comfortable environment to the participants. Lastly, the participants were



367 assured that the recorded interview was kept by the researchers for safe-keeping and would  
368 be destroyed after two years. Moreover, the information obtained were to be used for  
369 research purposes only.

370

371

## REFERENCES

372

373

374

375

376

377

378

379

380

381

382

383

384

385

386

387

388

389

390

391

392

393

394

395

396

397

398

399

400

401

402

403

404

405

406

407

408

409

410

411

412

413

414

415

416

417

418

419

1. Acharya AS, Prakash A, Saxena P, Nigam A. Sampling: Why and how of it. *Indian Journal of Medical Specialties*. 2013; 4(2), 330-333.
2. Ajithkumar MU. Training of teachers: Institutionalising training and development of academic faculty of TVET institutions for realising excellence. In *India: Preparation for the World of Work*. 2016; (pp. 183-210). Springer VS, Wiesbaden.
3. Albashiry NM, Voogt JM, Pieters JM. Maintaining Curriculum Consistency of Technical and Vocational Educational Programs through Teacher Design Teams. *Man in India*. 2016; 96(1), 599-608.
4. Alseddiqi M, Mishra R, Pislaru C. Design and development of an on-line work-based learning (WBL) module to enhance technical and vocational education (TVE) system in Bahrain. 2010. In *Global Learn* (pp. 1168-1178). Association for the Advancement of Computing in Education (AACE).
5. Baldissoni G, Comberti L, Bosca S, Murè S. The analysis and management of unsafe acts and unsafe conditions; 2018. Data collection and analysis. *Safety Science*.
6. Birks M, Chapman Y, Francis K. Memoing in qualitative research: Probing data and processes. *Journal of research in nursing*. 2008; 13(1), 68-75.
7. Braun V, Clarke V. Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*. 2006; 3(2), 77-101.
8. Brinkmann S. *Interview*. Springer New York. 2014; 1008-1010.
9. Burbules NC, Torres CA. Globalization and education: Critical perspectives. Routledge. 2013.
10. Chinonso Okolie U, Nwonu Elom E, Uchechukwu Osuji C, Agu Igwe P. Improvement needs of Nigerian technical college teachers in teaching vocational and technical subjects. *International Journal of Training Research*. 2019; 17(1), 21-34.
11. Csibra G, Gergely G. Natural pedagogy. *Trends in cognitive sciences*. 2009;13(4), 148-153.
12. Creswell JW. *Qualitative research and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. London: Thousand Oaks. 1998.
13. Creswell JW, Clark VLP. *Designing and conducting mixed methods research*. Sage publications. 2017.
14. Crowley AL, Yow E, Barnhart HX, Daubert MA, Bigelow R, Sullivan DC, Douglas PS (2016). Critical review of current approaches for echocardiographic reproducibility and reliability assessment in clinical research. *Journal of the American Society of Echocardiography*. 2016;29(12), 1144-1154.
15. Eravia D, Handayani T. The opportunities and threats of small and medium enterprises in Pekanbaru: comparison between SMEs in food and restaurant industries. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*. 2015;169, 88-97.
16. Eti MC, Ogaji SOT, Probert SD. Strategic maintenance-management in Nigerian industries. *Applied energy*. 2006; 83(3), 211-227.
17. Etikan I, Musa SA, Alkassim RS. Comparison of convenience sampling and purposive sampling. *American journal of theoretical and applied statistics*. 2016;5(1), 1-4.
18. George G. Workplace ART programmes: Why do companies invest in them and are they working? *African Journal of AIDS research*. 2006; 5(2), 179-188.
19. Giddens A. *Runaway world: How globalization is reshaping our lives*. Taylor & Francis. 2003.
20. Golter P, Van Wie B, Brown G. Foundations for Validating a Critical Thinking Rubric. *Journal of STEM Education*. 2017;17(4).

- 420 21. Goodman SN, Fanelli D, Ioannidis JP. What does research reproducibility  
421 mean? *Science translational medicine*. 2016;8(341), 341ps12-341ps12.
- 422 22. Greenwood M, Kendrick T, Davies H, Gill FJ (2017). Hearing voices: Comparing two  
423 methods for analysis of focus group data. *Applied Nursing Research*, 35, 90-93.
- 424 23. Ismail N, Bakar AR, Hamzah R (2011). The expectation of TVE students teachers to  
425 choose teaching as a career.
- 426 24. Jenkins R. Globalization, production, employment and poverty: debates and  
427 evidence. *Journal of International Development*. 2013; 16(1), 1-12.
- 428 25. Joffe H. Thematic analysis. *Qualitative research methods in mental health and  
429 psychotherapy: A guide for students and practitioners*. 2012; 1, 210-223.
- 430 26. Haag PW. The challenges of career and technical education concurrent enrollment: An  
431 administrative perspective. *New directions for community colleges*. 2015; (169), 51-58.
- 432 27. Hammersley M. *Routledge Revivals: The Dilemma of Qualitative Method (1989):  
433 Herbert Blumer and the Chicago Tradition*. Routledge. 2018.
- 434 28. Hanapi Z, Nordin MS, Khamis A. Challenges faced by engineering lecturers in  
435 integrating technical and employability skills in the curriculum: A case study in  
436 Community College, Malaysia. *International Journal of Social Science and Humanity*.  
437 2015; 5(5), 483.
- 438 29. Kamin Y, Saud MS, Hamid MZA, Ahmad A. Implementation of Teaching Methods in  
439 Mechanical Engineering Program at the Malaysia's Vocational College. *Advanced  
440 Science Letters*. 2017;23(1), 569-572.
- 441 30. Kappelman LA, Jones MC, Johnson V, McLean ER, Boonme K.. Skills for success at  
442 different stages of an IT professional's career. *Commun. ACM*. 2016; 59(8), 64-70.
- 443 31. Kayode AA, Adeyemi AO. Revitalization of Technical and Vocational Education for  
444 Youth Employment and Poverty Alleviation. *International Journal of Educational  
445 Sciences*. 2016; 13(3), 262-270.
- 446 32. Kober N. *Reaching students: What research says about effective instruction in  
447 undergraduate science and engineering*. National Academies Press. 2015.
- 448 33. Kocór M. Skills shortages and mismatches on the Polish labour market and public  
449 policy recommendations. *Zarządzanie Publiczne*. 2017;42(4), 38-52.
- 450 34. Kuper A, Reeves S, Levinson W. An introduction to reading and appraising qualitative  
451 research. *Bmj*, 337, a288. 2008.
- 452 35. Κυπριός N. Effects of ISO 9000 certification on firms' financial performance. 2015.
- 453 36. Lakatos A, Borsos A. Effective Teaching Methods for Knowledge Transfer  
454 Improvement. In *Knowledge as Business Opportunity: Proceedings of the Management,  
455 Knowledge and Learning International Conference*. 2011;455-464. International School  
456 for Social and Business Studies, Celje, Slovenia.
- 457 37. Lincoln YS, Guba EG (1985). Establishing trustworthiness. *Naturalistic inquiry*.  
458 1985;289, 331.
- 459 38. Merriam SB, Grenier RS (Eds.) *Qualitative research in practice: Examples for  
460 discussion and analysis*. Jossey-Bass. 2019.
- 461 39. Mohamad MM, Saud MS, Ahmad A. The need in training and retraining for TVET  
462 teachers in Malaysia. *Journal of Technical Education and Training*. 2009; 1(1).
- 463 40. Mortos AR, San Jose AE. Polishing the skills: Training evaluation of basic teaching  
464 training course. *Journal of Studies in Social Sciences and Humanities*. 2018;4(2), 23-  
465 32.
- 466 41. Napoli RP. *The Impact of Globalization on American Society*. 2019.
- 467 42. O Nyumba T, Wilson K, Derrick CJ, Mukherjee N. The use of focus group discussion  
468 methodology: Insights from two decades of application in conservation. *Methods in  
469 Ecology and Evolution*. 2018; 9(1), 20-32.
- 470 43. Okoye R, Arimonu MO. Technical and Vocational Education in Nigeria: Issues,  
471 Challenges and a Way Forward. *Journal of Education and Practice*. 2016;7(3), 113-118.
- 472

- 473 44. Oviawe JI, Uwameiye R, Uddin PS. Bridging skill gap to meet technical, vocational  
474 education and training school-workplace collaboration in the 21st century. *International*  
475 *Journal of vocational education and training research*. 2017;3(1), 7-14.
- 476 45. Paryono P. Approaches to preparing TVET teachers and instructors in ASEAN member  
477 countries. *TVET@ Asia*.2015;5,1-27.
- 478 46. Rahmatizadeh S, Rajabifard A, Kalantari M, Ho S. A framework for selecting a fit-for-  
479 purpose data collection method in land administration. *Land Use Policy*. 2018;70, 162-  
480 171.
- 481 47. Reilly WT, Talley NJ, Pemberton JH, Zinsmeister AR. Validation of a questionnaire to  
482 assess fecal incontinence and associated risk factors. *Diseases of the colon & rectum*.  
483 2000;43(2), 146-153.
- 484 48. San Jose AE, Galang JG. Teaching strategies in teaching literature: Students in  
485 focus. *International Journal of Education and Research*. 2015;3(4).
- 486 49. San Jose AE, Bahket R, Alsalhi HHA. Teach us the way we want: Teaching approach  
487 for special needs students. *European Journal of Special Education Research*. 2017.
- 488 50. San Jose AE. Linguistic experiences of adult dyslexic learners. *UIC Research Journal*.  
489 2012;18(1), 1-1.
- 490 51. Scherer AG, Palazzo G. Globalization and corporate social responsibility. 2008.
- 491 52. Schwab K. *The fourth industrial revolution*. Currency. 2017.
- 492 53. Shrewsbury CM. What is feminist pedagogy? *Women's Studies Quarterly*. 1993;21(3/4),  
493 8-16.
- 494 54. Sobe NW, Kowalczyk J. Context, entanglement and assemblage as matters of concern  
495 in comparative education research. In *World Yearbook of Education 2018* (pp. 197-  
496 204). Routledge. 2017.
- 497 55. Stuckey HL. The second step in data analysis: Coding qualitative research  
498 data. *Journal of Social Health and Diabetes*. 2015;3(01), 007-010.
- 499 56. Tapan SM. Using ICT in Teaching–Learning at the Polytechnic Institutes of  
500 Bangladesh: Constrains and Limitations. *Teachers World-Journal of Education and*  
501 *Research*. 2009;33, 207-217.
- 502 57. Thompson EP. Globalization in Historical. *Globalization and Its Critics: Perspectives*  
503 *from Political Economy*. 2016;67.
- 504 58. Trochim WM. Qualitative validity. 2006.
- 505 59. Tugade MM, Fredrickson BL. Resilient individuals use positive emotions to bounce back  
506 from negative emotional experiences. *Journal of personality and social psychology*.  
507 2004;86(2), 320.
- 508 60. Udoka ST. The global economic crisis: A challenges to curriculum of implementation in  
509 technical and vocational education technology in Nigeria. 2013. Retrieved 20th August  
510 2019.
- 511 61. Urutyan VE, Litzenberg KK. Skills, qualities and experiences needed for future leaders  
512 in food and agribusiness industries of Armenia. *International Food and Agribusiness*  
513 *Management Review*. 2010; 13(1030-2016-82882), 1-16.
- 514 62. Vaira M. Globalization and higher education organizational change: A framework for  
515 analysis. *Higher education*. 2004;48(4), 483-510.
- 516 63. van Manen M. *Phenomenology of practice: Meaning-giving methods in*  
517 *phenomenological research and writing*. Routledge. 2016.
- 518 64. Vince-Garland KM, Holden K, Garland DP. Individualized clinical coaching in the TLE  
519 TeachLivE lab: Enhancing fidelity of implementation of system of least prompts among  
520 novice teachers of students with autism. *Teacher Education and Special Education*.  
521 2016;39(1), 47-59.
- 522 65. Visser-Wijnveen GJ, Stes A, van Petegem P. Development and validation of a  
523 questionnaire measuring teachers' motivations for teaching in higher education. *Higher*  
524 *Education*. 2012;64(3), 421-436.

- 525 66. Weitzman EA. Analyzing qualitative data with computer software. *Health Services*  
526 *Research*, 34(5 Pt 2), 1241. Weitzman, E. A. (1999). Analyzing qualitative data with  
527 computer software. *Health Services Research*. 1999;34(5 Pt 2), 1241.
- 528 67. Yusof Y, Roddin R, Awang H. What Students Need, and What Teacher Did: The Impact  
529 of Teacher's Teaching Approaches to the Development of Students' Generic  
530 Competences. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*. 2004;204, 36-44.
- 531 68. Yusof Y, Roddin R, Awang H, Ibrahim-Mukhtar M. Metacognitive Strategies in  
532 Promoting the Development of Generic Competences in High TVE in  
533 Malaysia. *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities*. 2017.

UNDER PEER REVIEW