



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research in Botany
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRIB_52684
Title of the Manuscript:	Efficacy of excised-bud (EB) and half-corm (HC) at four physiological growth stages on plantlet regeneration of Musa genotypes
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link: (<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



[SDI Review Form 1.6](#)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>Abstract</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Conclusion: confusing sentences and results. <p>Introduction</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Line 19: causes slow regeneration: deleted - Line 20: what is meant by lateral shoots in bananas? - Line 21; What is the relationship between "pest and disease susceptibility" and "natural suckering"? Why are they put in one sentence? - Line 40 (9 to 14 suckers) and line 46 (500 suckers) is so much different. <p>Preparation of Macro-propagation Materials</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Line 98: What is meant by "buds"? - Line 98: Is the weight of buds 150kg? How big is it? - The figure showing how the buds are excised will help in understanding the treatments. <p>Treatment Applications and Experimental Design</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - When an experiment consists of three factors, then the Three-Way ANOVA should be used in analyzing data. Firstly, the interaction among the three factors will be analyzed. If it is not significantly different, then secondly, each interaction between any two factors will analyzed. If this is not significantly different either, then main factors will be analyzed. - In line 106, it is written, "giving a 3 X 4 X 2 factorial combination". Results show that four physiological stages is not considered as the treatment, since they are analyzed separately. - The figures showing the methods in scarification is very essential. <p>Data Collection and Statistical Analyses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Line 120: Why must data be transformed? <p>RESULTS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All treatments were replicated four times, but all results (mean) showed the integer numbers. They should be in decimal numbers. - Results as shown in Fig 1, 2, 3 and 4 just compared between 2 treatments (EB and HC), so the T-test should be applied for these treatments instead of ANOVA. - "Significantly different" does not mean "increase x% more". 	
Minor REVISION comments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It is better to present the results (data) and analysis in table forms, so the effects of the treatments can be seen clearly. - The use of terminology should be consistent, i.e. propagules, corms, buds, etc. or genotype, variety, landrace, spp, etc - Complete morphology of banana should be included. 	
Optional/General comments	Data analysis should be improved especially in interpreting the significantly different among the treatments. Special focus should be given in analysis of the interaction among/between treatments.	



[SDI Review Form 1.6](#)

PART 2:

	<u>Reviewer's comment</u>	<u>Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</u>
<u>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</u>	<u>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</u>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Dwi Susanto</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>Universiti Malaysia Kelantan, Malaysia</i>